# Appendix 3 The legislation

# The Trade Practices Act

### Access regime

Part IIIA of the Act establishes a national legislative regime to facilitate third party access to the services of certain facilities of national significance such as electricity grids or natural gas pipelines. Its object is to encourage competition in upstream or downstream markets.

Under this regime a party may apply to the National Competition Council asking it to recommend that a service be declared.

The Council cannot recommend declaration of a service unless it is satisfied that:

- access to the service would promote competition in another market;
- it would be uneconomical for anyone to develop another facility to provide the service;
- the facility is of national significance;
- access would not cause undue risk to health or safety;
- access is not already the subject of an effective regime; and
- access would not be against the public interest.

Having made an assessment according to the criteria, the Council must recommend to the Minister either that the service be declared or that it not be declared.

The Council's recommendation is considered by the designated Minister who decides whether or not to declare the service. (Where a facility is owned or operated by a State or Territory Government which is a party to the Competition Principles Agreement, the designated Minister is the responsible State/Territory Minister. Otherwise the designated Minister will be the responsible Commonwealth Minister.)

The Minister's decision is subject to appeal to the Australian Competition Tribunal.

Once a service is declared, parties are free to negotiate terms and conditions of access. If the parties cannot agree to the terms and conditions for access they may decide to refer the dispute to private arbitration. If the parties reach agreement through arbitration or negotiation they may apply to the Commission to have the contract registered. In deciding whether to register a contract the Commission must apply a public interest test. Once registered the contract may be enforced as if it were a Commission arbitration determination under Part IIIA.

If the provider of the service and the party seeking access cannot agree on any aspect of access to a declared service, either the provider or the party seeking access can notify the Commission of a dispute and the Commission can make a determination setting the terms and conditions of access. Such determinations may be reviewed by the Australian Competition Tribunal upon application by a party to the determination. A party to the determination may seek to enforce the determination through the Federal Court.

Part IIIA not only provides a national regime to facilitate third party access, but allows State and Territory Governments to seek exemption from declaration for services covered by conforming regimes. Under Part IIIA, State or Territory Governments may apply to have their access regimes recommended as 'effective' by the National Competition Council. Recommendations on the effectiveness of State or Territory access regimes are made to the relevant Commonwealth Minister on the basis of an assessment of the regime according to

the relevant principles set out in the

Competition Principles Agreement. Having

received a recommendation the Commonwealth Minister must also make an assessment of the effectiveness of the access regime by applying the relevant principles set out in the Competition Principles Agreement. Once a decision is made by the Commonwealth Minister it must be published. An access regime which has been recognised by the Commonwealth Minister as effective, and continues to be recognised as such, cannot be declared under Part IIIA.

As an alternative to the declaration process Part IIIA allows a service provider to give an access undertaking to the Commission specifying the terms and conditions on which access will be made available to third parties. The Commission has a discretion to accept or reject an undertaking proposal. However, the Commission cannot accept an access undertaking if the service concerned is a declared service. If the Commission accepts such an undertaking the services provided by the facility cannot be recommended for declaration by the National Competition Council or declared by the designated Minister.

If the Commission thinks that a provider of an access undertaking has breached that undertaking, the Commission may apply to the Federal Court to enforce the undertaking as accepted by the Commission.

Further information regarding access may be obtained by purchasing the Commission publication entitled *Access Regime*.

# Anti-competitive practices

The Commission or the Minister can bring a civil action in the Federal Court seeking the imposition of pecuniary penalties — up to \$10 million for a corporation and up to \$500 000 for an individual, or can seek injunctions, ancillary orders, or, in relation to a merger, divestiture. The Minister will cease to be able to initiate civil action after the second commencement date.

Individuals and corporations can, through private action, seek various remedies from the Federal Court for breaches of the restrictive trade practices provisions of Part IV of the Act.

The remedies include injunction (except for mergers), damages, ancillary orders, or, in relation to a merger, divestiture.

The restrictive trade practices provisions contained in Part IV of the Act — ss 45 to 50A — prohibit the following types of anticompetitive conduct. However, some can be authorised by the Commission.

Agreements affecting competition — these are prohibited if they have the purpose or effect of substantially lessening competition. Prohibited outright are:

- most price agreements; and
- agreements containing exclusionary provisions, commonly known as primary boycotts, i.e. collective refusals to deal with another party.

Price fixing agreements between competitors may be authorised where significant benefit to the public can be established.

Secondary boycotts — are prohibited if their purpose is to cause substantial loss or damage to a business, or a substantial lessening of competition in a market. They generally involve action by two persons, in concert, engaging in conduct that hinders or prevents a third person from supplying to, or acquiring goods or services from, a fourth person.

Misuse of market power — a corporation with a substantial degree of market power is prohibited from taking advantage of this power for the purpose of eliminating or damaging an actual or potential competitor, preventing the entry of a person into any market, or deterring or preventing a person from engaging in competitive conduct in any market.

Provisions against misuse of market power also extend to companies involved in trans-Tasman trade, whether based in Australia or New Zealand. Australian legal proceedings can be heard in New Zealand and vice versa.

Exclusive dealing — it is unlawful for a supplier to attempt directly or indirectly to interfere with the freedom of buyers to buy from other suppliers or to sell to whom they choose, e.g. by imposing territorial or customer restrictions on the buyer. Similarly, buyers cannot impose restrictions on the freedom of suppliers to sell as they wish. Exclusive dealing is prohibited

only if it has the purpose or effect of substantially lessening competition. The Competition Policy Reform Act prohibitions extend to the resupply of services as well as goods. Supplying goods or services on condition that the buyer will acquire other goods or services from another supplier, even a related company, is prohibited outright regardless of its effect on competition (third line forcing). However, this conduct can be notified to the Commission, and may be authorised on public benefit grounds.

Resale price maintenance — a supplier must not directly or indirectly fix a price below which resellers may not sell or advertise their products or services, e.g. by threatening to cut off supplies or actually cutting them off. Two exemptions from this prohibition are genuinely recommended prices and loss leader selling. However, resale price maintenance on both goods and services is authorisable provided it delivers a benefit to the public such that it should be allowed to occur.

Mergers — are prohibited where they would have the effect, or likely effect, of substantially lessening competition in a market. However, such mergers can be authorised on public benefit grounds. (See 'Authorisation' below.)

### Unconscionable conduct

The concept of unconscionable conduct involves the exploitation by the stronger party of an evident special disability or disadvantage suffered by the other party.

Part IVA prohibits unconscionable conduct in:

- commercial dealings (s. 51AA);
- consumer transactions (s. 51AB); and
- small business dealings (s. 51AC), after 1 July 1998.

# Industry codes of conduct

Part IVB prohibits contraventions by corporations of applicable industry codes of

practice. An applicable code is one that is mandatory for the industry or a voluntary industry code that binds the corporation.

## Consumer protection

The consumer protection provisions of the Act contained in Part V — ss 51A to 75A — deal with:

- unfair practices Division 1
- product safety and information Division 1A
- conditions and warranties Division 2
- actions against manufacturers/importers Division 2A
- product liability Part VA

There is also Part IVA relating to unconscionable conduct.

Their aim is to strengthen the position of consumers relative to sellers, distributors and manufacturers by ensuring that businesses compete fairly on price and quality, and by implying into consumer contracts non-excludable conditions and warranties as to quality, fitness and title.

Individuals and corporations can bring private actions in any court of competent jurisdiction for contravention of the consumer protection provisions of Division 1, Part V of the Act seeking damages, injunctions, or ancillary orders.

The Commission can bring a criminal prosecution in the Federal Court for breach of these provisions seeking monetary penalties of up to \$200 000 for corporations and up to \$40 000 for individuals. Civil, not criminal, proceedings can be taken for s. 52 (misleading conduct) in Division 1, Part V.

The Commission, the Minister, or any other person can ask the court for an injunction but only the Commission or the Minister can apply for a court order requiring corrective advertising (not applicable to a breach of unconscionable conduct).

Only individuals or corporations can bring private actions for breaches of a seller's

conditions and warranties, arising under Division 2, and against manufacturers or importers under Division 2A of Part V.

Section 51AB of Part IVA prohibits unconscionable conduct in consumer transactions

Actions concerned with product liability can be brought by individuals, or as representative actions by the Commission on one or more person's behalf. A claimant does not have to prove negligence but does have to prove that on the balance of probabilities the product supplied by the manufacturer or importer was defective and that the defect was the cause of a loss or injury.

Actions must be taken within ten years of supply of the goods.

# Product safety and product information

The Commission is responsible for enforcing ss 65C and 65D of Division 1A of Part V of the Act, which relate to the non-compliance of goods with standards or bans, and for conducting conferences to review proposed and emergency bans or proposed compulsory recalls of consumer products.

The Consumer Affairs Division of the Commonwealth Department of Treasury is responsible for product safety policy and product recalls.

Compulsory consumer product standards for a particular good may be made by regulation or declared by the Minister for Financial Services and Regulation by a notice in the Commonwealth Gazette. There are two types of compulsory consumer product standard.

Safety standards require goods to comply with particular performance, composition, contents, methods of manufacture or processing, design, construction, finish or packaging rules e.g. to display warning labels on the flammability of children's nightwear.

Information standards require prescribed information to be given to consumers when

they purchase specified goods e.g. labelling garments or household fabrics to indicate the most suitable method of cleaning.

The Minister has the power to:

- by a notice in the Commonwealth Gazette, declare as unsafe those goods that may cause injury to a person — the supply of goods declared unsafe is banned for 18 months following the declaration. Bans may then be renewed, allowed to expire, or made permanent;
- issue public warning notices about possibly unsafe goods; and
- order suppliers to recall goods that have safety related defects.

Before goods are declared unsafe, or a permanent ban or compulsory recall order is brought into effect, suppliers of the goods may request a conference with the Commission to discuss the order. The request must be made within 10 days, or longer if the Commission permits, and the conference must be held within 14 days.

A supplier may also voluntarily decide to recall unsafe goods. The Minister must be notified of the details, in writing, within two days of the voluntary recall.

If it appears to the Minister that certain goods create an imminent risk of death, serious illness or severe injury, an emergency order can immediately be made, without a prior conference, for a ban or a product recall, disclosure of defect and disposal, repair, replacement or refund of price.

The same remedies apply for breaches of the safety provisions as for unfair business practices:

- monetary penalties of up to \$200 000 for companies and \$40 000 for individuals;
- injunctions;
- damages; and
- corrective advertising.

Ancillary orders are also available for persons who have suffered loss or damage because of the conduct.

Individuals who have suffered loss or damage as a result of a failure to comply with a standard, banning order or compulsory recall order can seek, by way of a private action, damages, injunction or other court order. Depending on the amount of damages involved, individuals can also seek remedies through a lower court e.g. State, Territory or small claims tribunal.

## **Product liability**

Under Part VA, a person who is injured, or whose property is damaged, by a defective product has a right to compensation by the manufacturer of the product. Individuals can bring actions. The Commission can also bring representative actions on behalf of one or more persons.

# Price exploitation in relation to the New Tax System

In July 1999 Part VB was inserted in the Trade Practices Act to prevent the exploitation of consumers or excessive profit taking by business because of the introduction of the New Tax System. The key element of Part VB is the prohibition on price exploitation during the New Tax System transition period from 8 July 1999 to 30 June 2002.

Price exploitation is made up of three elements:

- 1. there is a regulated supply;
- 2. the price of that supply is unreasonably high having regard to the New Tax System changes alone; and
- 3. the price of that supply is unreasonably high, and not attributable to the supplier's costs, supply and demand conditions or any other relevant matter.

#### Regulated supply

A regulated supply is:

- a good or service supplied during the New Tax System transition period and before the GST is implemented;
- a good or service supplied by a person who is registered, or required to be registered, under the GST Act; and
- a supply that, had it occurred after the implementation date, would have been taxable, GST-free or input taxed.

The vast majority of goods and services supplied by businesses operating in Australia are covered by the definition.

#### Statutory powers

The Commission has statutory functions and powers to enable it to enforce the prohibition on price exploitation, including the ability to:

- formulate guidelines for when the price for regulated supplies contravene the prohibition on price exploitation;
- monitor prices;
- issue a s. 75AW Notice when the Commission considers a business has contravened the prohibition on price exploitation;
- issue a s. 75AX Notice specifying a maximum price that, in the Commission's opinion, may be charged for a supply;
- take court enforcement action; and
- report to the Minister each quarter about the operations of the Commission in the period.

#### Guidelines

The Commission is required to formulate written guidelines to explain when prices for regulated supplies contravene the prohibition on price exploitation.

The Commission must have regard to these guidelines when issuing, varying or revoking a s. 75AW or s. 75AX Notice.

The Federal Court may have regard to the guidelines in any proceeding relating to alleged price exploitation.

#### **Section 75AW Notice**

Where the Commission considers that price exploitation has occurred it may issue a Notice under s. 75AW.

The Notice must identify:

- the corporation that made the supply;
- the kind of supply made; and
- the circumstances in which the supply was made.

The Notice must state the Commission's opinion that the price for the supply was unreasonably high, and that it was not attributable to the supplier's costs, supply and demand conditions, or any other relevant matter. The Notice must also show that it is a Notice under s. 75AW.

A s. 75AW Notice will constitute prima facie evidence in proceedings brought by the Commission when seeking penalties or an injunction in relation to the contravention.

The Commission may revoke the Notice of its own initiative or on application by the relevant corporation. The Commission must give written notice of any variation or revocation to the corporation.

#### **Section 75AX Notice**

The Commission may issue a Notice under s. 75AX which specifies a maximum price that, in the Commission's opinion, may be charged for a supply. The Notice must specify that it is a Notice under s. 75AX. The Notice must also identify the supply, the circumstances of the supply and the period over which the maximum price is to prevail. This period can extend up to the end of the transition period.

The Commission may publish a s. 75AX Notice in a manner it considers appropriate, including in a national newspaper.

The Commission may revoke the Notice of its own initiative or on application by the relevant corporation. The Commission must give written notice of any variation or revocation to the corporation.

Details of s. 75AX Notices must be provided to the Minister in the quarterly report.

#### **Penalties**

The Commission may seek the following remedies for a breach of Part VB:

- monetary penalties of up to \$10 million for companies;
- monetary penalties of up to \$500 000 for individuals;
- injunctions;
- a court order requiring a person to provide a regulated supply at a price less than the price specified in the order; and
- a court order requiring that person, or a person involved in a contravention, to refund money to a person specified in the order.

There is no right of private action under Part VB.

#### Monitoring prices

The Commission can monitor prices to assess the effect of the New Tax System changes on prices charged by corporations for supplies during the transition period.

The Commission may also monitor prices to assess if there has been, is or may be a contravention of the prohibition on price exploitation.

#### Section 75AY Notice

A member of the Commission may serve a written notice on a person requiring them to provide specified information or documents that the member considers will or may be useful to the Commission in monitoring prices. Such a request may be for information or documents relating to prices:

- before, or after, any or all of the New Tax System changes have taken effect;
- before, or after, the start of the New Tax System transition period; and
- in a situation, or during a period, specified in the Notice.

If the person fails to provide the information, or provides information that is intentionally or recklessly misleading, they may be liable for a penalty of 20 penalty units.

#### Reporting

The Commission is required to provide the Minister with a written report on a quarterly basis. This report must cover the operations of the Commission under Part VB during the quarter and the report must specify all s. 75AX Notices. The quarterly report is provided every three months, starting on 1 January, 1 April, 1 July and 1 October.

The Minister is under an obligation to make the report public, by such means as the Minister considers appropriate.

#### Jurisdiction

Section 75AU relates to corporations. All States and the Northern Territory have introduced complementary legislation to ensure the Commission can apply the price exploitation provisions to all businesses, including unincorporated businesses, persons resident in State jurisdictions and State Government entities carrying on a business.

# Authorisation and notification

Authorisation and notification are processes whereby the Commission has the power to grant immunity from court action for certain practices that would otherwise be in breach of the Act.

#### **Authorisation**

The immunity given by authorisation operates only from the time it is granted in the form of a final authorisation by the Commission.

The Commission's only function in considering an application for authorisation is to apply one of two tests, depending on the conduct in question.

For agreements that may substantially lessen competition, the applicant must satisfy the Commission that the agreement results in a benefit to the public that outweighs any anticompetitive effect.

For primary and secondary boycotts, resale price maintenance, third line forcing, and mergers, the applicant must satisfy the Commission that the conduct results in a benefit to the public such that it should be allowed to occur.

The Commission must look at the effect on competition in the market overall, not at the effect on individual competitors.

Once the application has been considered the Commission issues a draft determination and provides an opportunity for interested parties to request a conference. After the conference (if any) the Commission reconsiders the application and issues a final determination.

Authorisation cannot be granted for misuse of market power (s. 46).

Mergers: Authorisation applications for mergers are covered by additional specific legislative requirements.

The Commission must make a decision on such applications within 30 days of receiving them (plus any time taken by the applicant to provide additional information sought by the Commission).

The Act provides for the Commission to extend the period to 45 days in complex matters.

Authorisation is deemed to be granted if the Commission does not make a decision within whichever time frame applies.

In making its assessment the Commission will consider all potential public benefits from the proposed merger.

It is specifically required by the Act to regard as public benefits:

- a significant increase in the real value of exports; or
- significant import substitution.

It must also take into account all other relevant matters that relate to the international competitiveness of Australian industry.

#### **Notification**

Notification is available only for exclusive dealing, including third line forcing.

For notification of exclusive dealing conduct, immunity operates from the date of lodgment with the Commission and remains unless revoked by the Commission. The protection cannot be revoked unless the Commission is satisfied that the conduct substantially lessens competition in the relevant market and there is insufficient public benefit flowing from the conduct to outweigh the lessening of competition.

In the case of third line forcing, protection is not accorded from the time of notification but comes into force at the end of a prescribed period from the time the Commission receives the notice, unless the Commission forms the view within the specified period that the likely benefit to the public from the conduct will not outweigh the likely detriment to the public. If immunity has commenced it is open at any time for the Commission to review the conduct and issue a draft revocation notice as with other notifications. Once a final revocation notice has been issued the conduct will no longer be protected after 31 days or from such later date as the Commission may specify.

Before a notification can be revoked an opportunity must be given for a conference with interested parties. An application for a review of a decision to revoke can be made to the Australian Competition Tribunal.

For both authorisation and notification procedures the Commission is required to keep a public register of all related documents. Copies of this information are available for inspection at Commission offices in each capital city. However, commercially sensitive material for which confidentiality has been granted by the Commission will not be available for public inspection.

#### **Fees**

- Application for merger authorisations (s. 88(9)) \$15 000
- Authorisation applications other than under s. 88(9) — \$7500
  - Additional related authorisation applications — \$1500
- Notifications \$2500 (other than for third line forcing)
  - Additional related notifications \$500

- Third line forcing notifications lodged by an individual or proprietary company \$100
- Third line forcing notifications lodged by persons other than individuals or proprietary companies \$1000
  - Additional related third line forcing notifications — \$200

#### **Telecommunications**

Part XIB prohibits anti-competitive conduct in the telecommunications industry. The Commission can issue competition notices stating that the carrier or service provider has contravened the competition rule. If the carrier or service provider continues the conduct, the Commission can seek remedy (e.g. injunction) and pecuniary penalty (up to \$10 million in fines for each breach) through an order of the Federal Court.

Part XIC establishes a telecommunicationsspecific regime for facilitating access to the networks of competing carriers. The Commission may declare certain services to make it available to access seekers, following a public inquiry or a recommendation by the Telecommunications Access Forum. The Commission's other roles include considering access undertakings from carriers and carriage service providers and arbitrating access disputes.

### **Private actions**

Individuals or corporations can bring private actions for contravention of restrictive trade practices provisions (Part IV), the unconscionable conduct provisions (Part IVA), or the consumer protection provisions (Parts V & VA) of the Trade Practices Act.

#### Remedies include:

- damages (s. 82);
- injunction (except for mergers prohibited by s. 50) (s. 80);
- ancillary orders in favour of persons who suffer loss or damage, including return of property, return of money, specific

performance, rescission or variation of contracts, and provision of repairs or spare parts (s. 87). (There is a wider scope for such orders arising from breaches of Parts IVA & V than for Part IV breaches); and

divestiture of shares in relation to an unlawful merger (s. 81).

Jurisdiction to hear private actions arising from breaches of Part V has been extended by recent Commonwealth legislation and will be extended further if proposed complementary State legislation is passed.

The purpose of the *Jurisdiction of Courts* (*Cross-Vesting*) Act 1987 is to provide a more convenient and less expensive method of dealing with civil matters by permitting the Federal Court or a State or Territory Supreme Court either to deal with all related proceedings or to transfer them to another appropriate court.

The Cross-Vesting Act provides that, where a matter covering unconscionable conduct (Part IVA), unfair practices (ss 51A–65), all product safety and product information (ss 65B–65U), or product liability (Part VA) has been raised in the Federal Court or in a State or Territory Supreme Court, a party may apply to have the matter transferred to a State court that has appropriate jurisdiction for the remedies sought.

The additional jurisdiction does not apply to Part IV matters. The Cross-Vesting Act will not confer jurisdiction on inferior State courts until State complementary legislation has been passed.

The Jurisdiction of Courts (Miscellaneous Amendments) Act 1987 invests State and Territory Supreme Courts and inferior courts with concurrent jurisdiction in private action proceedings under the unfair trading practices and product safety and product information divisions of Part V of the Trade Practices Act within the limits of their various jurisdictions — for example as to subject matter and amount in issue. The grant of jurisdiction to inferior courts is further limited to remedies of a kind they could grant under relevant State or Territory law.

Generally, cross-vesting of jurisdiction and the investing of new jurisdiction in State courts in trade practices matters is in addition to jurisdiction already enjoyed by those courts either as a matter of general law or by other

statutes. Appeals from State and Territory courts are heard in their relevant appeal courts.

A defence based on Part IV of the Trade Practices Act can be raised in Supreme Court proceedings (Carlton and United Breweries v Castlemaine Tooheys Ltd, 1986 ATPR 40712) and presumably the same would apply to defences based on Parts IVA or V.

With State legislation mirroring Part V of the Trade Practices Act now operating in all States and Territories, this legislation will minimise jurisdictional issues which might otherwise arise.

# Guidance, research and information

The Commission is required by s. 28 of the Trade Practices Act to disseminate information and undertake research projects. The main purpose of this requirement is to make the business community more aware of their obligations and rights under the Act and make consumers aware of the relevance of the Act to them.

The Commission therefore produces a range of publications, makes Commission staff available to speak to consumer and industry groups, and arranges seminars and workshops on matters of topical interest.

# The Prices Surveillance Act

The Prices Surveillance Act enables the Commission to examine the prices of selected goods and services in the Australian economy.

The three pricing functions assigned to the Commission are:

- to vet the proposed price rises of any business organisations placed under prices surveillance;
- to hold inquiries into pricing practices and related matters, and to report the findings to the responsible Commonwealth Minister; and

to monitor the prices, costs and profits of an industry or business and to report the results to the Minister.

### Prices surveillance

The Minister determines which organisations, goods or services should be subjected to prices surveillance. These are formally 'declared'. In cases where an organisation is specified, the Minister must nominate how long the declaration must remain in effect.

A declared organisation can not raise the price of a declared product beyond its peak price of the previous 12 months unless it fulfils the requirements of the Act. It is liable to a \$10 000 penalty if it does not comply.

The declared organisation has to notify the Commission of a proposed price rise and the terms and conditions of supply. The prohibition on supply ceases if:

- the Commission advises it does not object to the proposed increase; or
- the declared organisation agrees to implement a lower price specified by the Commission; or
- the prescribed period initially 21 days expires.

The Commission has the option of recommending an inquiry — and an extension of the prohibition on a price rise — to the Minister in cases where the outcome of the prices surveillance procedure is perceived to be unsatisfactory.

The Commission maintains a public register of surveillance matters showing price notifications, the Commission's deliberations, the outcome and the reasons for the outcome.

### Inquiries

The Minister determines the subject of a Commission inquiry. The Commission has to give widespread and reasonable notice of the inquiry and serve individual notices on any organisations specially identified in the Minister's directions.

During the period of the inquiry, an organisation that has been served with the notice can not raise its price beyond its peak price of the previous 12 months unless it fulfils the requirements of the Act. It is liable to a \$10 000 penalty if it does. However, the Commission can authorise interim price increases.

A report of the Commission's findings and recommendations is submitted to the Minister and a copy is sent to any notified organisation on the same day. Any notified organisation has to advise the Commission of its proposed prices within 14 days of receiving a copy of the report. It could be fined \$1000 if it fails to do so. The Commission has to make public those prices within another 14 days.

## **Monitoring**

The Commission can monitor the prices, costs and profits of an industry or business. The Minister determines which industries or businesses are monitored and how often the Commission should report. The report is submitted to the Minister and copies are sent to the monitored organisations on the same day. Inquiry and monitoring reports are to be made available to the public as soon as possible after they have been submitted to the Minister.